



CITY COUNCIL MEETING
212 MAIN STREET
Northampton, Massachusetts
December 18, 2025

Roll Call

A regular meeting of the City Council was called to order by Council President Alex Jarrett at 6:30 p.m. Upon a roll call, the following City Councilors were present:

- At-Large Councilor Marissa Elkins, 6:31 pm
- Ward 1 Councilor Stanley Moulton, III
- Ward 3 Councilor Quaverly Rothenberg
- Ward 5 Councilor Alexander Jarrett
- Ward 7 Councilor Rachel Maiore
- At-Large Councilor Garrick Perry
- Ward 2 Councilor Deborah Klemer
- Ward 4 Councilor Jeremy Dubs
- Ward 6 Councilor Marianne LaBarge

Announcement that Meeting Audio/Video Recorded

Councilor Jarrett announced that the meeting was being audio/video recorded.

Public Hearings

Public Hearings
None.

Public Comment

Public Comment
Councilor Jarrett explained the procedure he would use in conducting public comment and opened the floor to comments.

[Editor’s note: For this final meeting of the 2024-2025 City Council session, Council Chambers was packed with members of the public and former elected officials present to recognize and pay tribute to outgoing Ward 6 Councilor Marianne LaBarge, who, with 28 years of service, held the distinction of being the longest-serving city councilor in Northampton history. Many of the public comments consisted of accolades extolling Councilor LaBarge’s accomplishments.]

Addressing the council as a whole, [former Council President] **Jim Nash, Northampton**, extended his thanks to them for their service to the city as the term comes to a close. He particularly thanked the four councilors stepping down who he had the honor of serving with, namely Councilor Elkins, Councilor Jarrett and Councilor Moulton. To them, he offered thanks for leading important community discussions around zoning, housing, policing and cannabis to name a few. It was an honor serving with all three on Legislative Matters. He thanked them for their leadership and the grace they brought to this chamber.

Addressing Councilor LaBarge, Mr. Nash said she has pretty much been on City Council the entire 30 years he’s lived here, serving as a model of what a city councilor should be. When he joined the council, Gerry Budgar advised him, “Jim, watch Marianne. No one is better at constituent service.” He did. For three decades, residents of Ward 6 were blessed to have a councilor who answered every phone call, met with every resident at their earliest convenience and was always a champion for people vulnerable and in need. Referring to her reputation for operating with a big heart, he thanked her for her lifetime of service.

He closed by thanking Northampton Open Media, the Mayor, city staff and Administrative Assistant Laura Krutzler for their service.

Nancy Smith, Chapel Street, publicly thanked Councilor Rothenberg for her courageous fight to bring transparency and the public into the process instead of the ‘closed doors for the rich and powerful’ process which has plagued the city for decades, a process that has hoarded money for vanity and capital projects for the rich and powerful while starving schools and vital city services. The truth, commitment and fight she brought to this battle has been unparalleled. The fire and passion she brought inspired others on council and in the community to stand up and speak out. “You sparked hope in a people’s revolution for change . . . “

People banded together because there was hope because they had a relentless fighter on their side who inspired others to ask questions and fight back, too.

“Sadly, our corrupt city and its wealthy owners made you pay dearly for your courage and fight. . . The unjust and outrageous way you were treated by these power brokers and those who service them is a

testament to how effective a leader you are” she asserted. “If the bad guys are after you, you know you’re doing something right.”

Hailing her as a ‘hero,’ she assured her that her supporters will not go away. “Bring the fire,” she urged.

Nancy also thanked Councilor LaBarge for her decades of service. Stopping the destruction of their working-class neighborhoods is her #1 issue. “Every people’s meeting in any ward I ever attended, you were always there,” she attested. It speaks volumes about the leader and person she is and meant the world to all of them. “Enjoy the holidays, everyone,” she concluded.

Northampton Police Chief John Cartledge recognized and thanked Councilor LaBarge for her decades of dedicated service to the community. Her commitment to the city and, in particular, her steadfast support of the police department has made a lasting impact. He is especially grateful for her support of him as Police Chief, especially during his time as interim chief. Her trust, guidance and advocacy has meant more than he can adequately express. Her leadership has always been rooted in a genuine desire to serve others and to make this community safer and stronger for everyone. “Your legacy will be felt for many years to come,” he assured.

He extended sincere thanks to all of the councilors for their years of service and dedication to the city. The work they do, often behind the scenes, is always a service to the public and helps ensure their community continues to move forward. He thanked them for their commitment, leadership and unwavering support.

Barbara Devlin, South Hadley, identified herself as an active member of the Northampton Rotary with a daughter and family in Northampton who is pleased to be here via Zoom to honor outgoing City Councilor Marianne LaBarge. She had intended to come in person but is battling a cough and cold. Marianne has been a long-time member of the Northampton Rotary and has helped with numerous rotary service projects, including the annual children’s Christmas party and more recently, the annual day of service. In 2022, Ms. Devlin volunteered to chair the club’s first day of service, a tree planting at R.K. Finn Ryan Road Elementary School. Since she was new to the area, she asked Councilor LaBarge for guidance on how to get the project off the ground. Councilor LaBarge jumped in enthusiastically. She advised her to contact the mayor and Director of Public Works and recommended outreach to the city forester, Urban Forestry Commission, Tree Northampton, the City Council, the Northampton Youth Commission and other potential volunteers. She contacted the Council President to arrange for her to speak at a Community Resources Committee meeting, encouraged fellow councilors to volunteer on the day of the event and participated herself in all but one day of service since 2022. Her email inbox contains numerous messages from Marianne throughout the planning process. Unfortunately, she didn’t save all the voice mails but there were many of those too. Marianne’s assistance on the Rotary Day of Service is just one of the many ways she contributed to the Northampton community over her many years on the City Council.

[She was told that was time.]

On behalf of the Northampton Rotary Club, she congratulated Councilor LaBarge on her many contributions and wished her the very best as she returned to private life.

Northampton Parks and Recreation Director Ann Marie Moggio, Leeds, thanked councilors for their service and dedication to the city, especially the outgoing ones. With all of her involvement with parks and recreation, she assured Councilor LaBarge that her love for the city shines in all that she does.

She read aloud a poem, concluding by saying, “Northampton is so much better thanks to you.”

Bill Dwight, Northampton, focused on councilors attending their last meeting of the term. He knows meetings inspire a host of feelings, many of them conflicting. He thanked Councilor Jarrett, referring to him as a person of significant integrity and temperance, especially under challenging circumstances; his balance and calmness will be missed. Councilor Moulton, too, displayed remarkable balance and fairness; his serenity and decency know few equals. Councilor Elkins – “I will miss your moxie and your analytical mind, and your commitment to collaboration and good outcomes. . . .” Her sophistication has been an asset that served them well, and he really appreciated her service.

To Councilor LaBarge, there are 30-somethings who have grown up here who have known only one ward councilor all their lives, he pointed out. “You and I got elected at the same time together, and I’ve retired twice since,” he quipped. She is a bridge between Northampton’s two generations, a context they will be poorer without.

And then there’s. . . oops, “time’s up,” he said.

DPW Director Donna LaScaleia thanked the council for its support of public works, its employees and all their operations. To her dear friend, Councilor Marianne LaBarge - on May 2, 2016, former Mayor David Narkewicz appointed her director in the City Hall hearing room. Councilor LaBarge was in attendance and one of the first people to whom she was introduced in Northampton. She has been a constant presence for her since that day. As DPW Director, she has had a front row seat to her advocacy. She has met so many of her residents at so many places at so many times. She has received emails from her at 3 and 4 o'clock in the morning and been awake to read them all. They have worked together on so many initiatives. Who doesn't remember Burts Pit Road before it was paved and Glendale Road before it was paved? She mentioned other projects undertaken together, such as intersection improvements on Route 66 and smaller items like 'Deer Crossing' signs or road striping.

Her representation of her constituents has been steadfast and inspirational, indicative of her commitment to her community. "You have pushed all of us to be better; you have pushed me to be better," she shared. It has been her great honor to serve all these years with her. She wished her good health and good fortune, and most importantly, great happiness. She thanked her for her friendship and support of her and all of their employees.

Gwen Agna, Northampton, said she would not repeat the incredible testimonies heard although she wanted to say those words as well. She thanked councilors who were leaving and those who will stay. As a retiring School Committee member, she knows how hard it is to be an elected official. She was an employee before, but being an elected official is quite a challenge. In particular, she thanked Councilor LaBarge. She kind of grew up as a professional in this town with her. When she was the principal and an administrator in the district's central office, she could count on her to be friendly, smiling, kind and supportive. She has always sought her out in different venues when they've been together. She knows her to be a very good representative councilor and knows she will be a model for many in the future. She wished her all the best.

Wendy Foxmyn, Leeds, Ward 7, happily represented by Councilor Maiore, thanked those who served and those no longer going to be serving on the council: Councilor Moulton, Councilor Jarrett, Councilor LaBarge, Councilor Elkins and Councilor Rothenberg. She has watched their meetings and it has not been an easy run. For all the differences and challenging discussions they've had, one thing that unites them is that everybody cares. "Keep that in mind," she urged.

Summer Cable, Florence, said Councilor Jarrett is her current and soon to be former representative. She thinks all the work he and the current council has done, particularly Councilor Elkins, Councilor Perry and Councilor Moulton, has been incredible. She thinks it should be reiterated and focused on that the work they do every day is not glamorous and is guaranteed to make a third of the city mad at them about something. Yet, they show up every day, sacrifice their Thursday nights and afternoons and do it with grace, patience and aplomb. She wants to honor what they have done during their terms and thank them and is glad they'll get their Thursdays back.

Joe Twarog, Florence, thanked Councilor LaBarge for her decades of services. She was incomparable as a city councilor. He remembers sitting on a folding chair on Burts Pit Road counting cars. She was instrumental in getting stop signs there. She was instrumental in getting working lights at Florence Road and Rocky Hill Road where people had been killed. She was 'councilor fix it.' She had a strong voice but was totally independent. She answered to her constituents. He recalled another time holding signs on Florence Road and Rocky Hill Road. As people went by, she could tell who was in the car. She knew their names and life stories, she knew their dogs' names. "That's what she was. . . We'll miss you."

Dan Breindel, downtown Northampton, reminded the council that, at the beginning of many of their terms in 2022, they voted to do two things: make a rule change to bring public comment from three minutes to two and pass an omnibus bill called the form-based code. He thinks many didn't realize what they were doing by voting the form-based code, but what it did was create a whole new zoning type. It rezoned many lots in the city without the notification to the public that was legally due. Councilor Jarrett, "I think you weren't aware that you got rid of affordability requirements," he posited. Councilor Elkins was not aware that it in any way changed parking requirements, et cetera, etc. That just means there needed to be some oversight on this giant bill. He and his neighbors came to them and tried to force them to do some oversight on these issues yet, over and over, no matter how often they asked, they were turned down, rejected, barred. Councilor Perry voted 'no' on bills that bounced back to him through email so he knew he never read them or the supporting evidence; Councilor LaBarge spoke to him at length about her issues with real estate development in the city yet did not back that up by her votes. There are many issues all over the city they have been begging them to look at; he named 'the \$3 million church purchase' and business owners throughout downtown saying that Picture Main Street will hurt them. Just because half of business owners say it won't hurt them doesn't make it controversial, it means that "you're hurting half of the business owners. . ."

“We’re asking for basic oversight. We’re not trying to force your hand; we’re asking you guys to pay some attention to these major issues.”

[Councilor Jarrett told him his time was up.]

Parents of disabled children have been coming to them saying their children are being underserved in the city schools, just like disabled people are telling them they are being underserved on the sidewalks and roads. . .

Mr. Breindel continued speaking without interruption and was muted.

A contingent of retired military officers entered the room accompanied by **Peggy Pease**. They aligned themselves in formation in front of Councilor LaBarge.

Tom Pease, Commander of VFW Post 8006, said it was with great pleasure that Post 8006 wished to congratulate her on her many years of services as a city councilor to their community and to honor her never-ending commitment to local military organizations. Not only has she served with genuine honesty and integrity, but true devotion. They could always count on her to be there, whether marching in a parade, sitting in many of their organization’s meetings or heading up meetings with the Veterans Council of Northampton. She is the true definition of community, involvement and dedication. Her contribution will be missed by all whose lives she has touched. “In passing, let us not say good-bye; let us say good-bye for now,” he concluded.

He presented her with a document signed by himself, William D. Ahearn, Corporation President and Auxiliary President Liz Cummings.

Peggy Pease presented her with flowers, and the color guard saluted and left the room.

Rachel Simpson, Westhampton Road, Ward 6, said she has lived in Northampton 57 years and for more than half that time, Councilor LaBarge has been the epitome of public service so she wanted to take a minute to thank her. It wasn’t until she moved to Ward 6 seven years ago that she realized how hard she works. She really cares about her constituents; she works for the people she represents and helps them in all kinds of ways, many of which go above and beyond the job of a city councilor. She’s done so much for so many people over the years; connecting people with financial assistance, addressing individual food insecurity, helping with housing, helping with traffic signs and pushing to get sidewalks built on Florence Road. Unlike many politicians, she does this work for the people she represents quietly, not for political points or fanfare but because she knows it’s the right thing to do. She has been quite fortunate to be her constituent and is grateful to know her and be her neighbor. She also thanked Councilor Moulton, Councilor Jarrett and Councilor Elkins for their service.

Patty Healey, Longfellow Drive, said Councilor LaBarge was her councilor. She looked outside her window one day 29 years ago and this little woman was coming up the driveway. When she opened the door, she said, “I’m Councilor LaBarge and I’m running for City Council.” She’s been fortunate to have her as her city councilor all this time. Within a year, she asked her to be her campaign manager. She said, ‘Don’t worry, you don’t have to do a thing; all I need is your name on this paper.’

She was a union member at Belchertown State School for many years and that’s where her passion grew to take care of people with disabilities. Her favorite committee was the Commission on Disabilities and that’s what she was most passionate about. She was a powerhouse. “Powerful people quaked in their boots when they saw that red Buick driving up the street,” she quipped. She had the DPW on speed dial. “She got everything taken care of in our neighborhood.” She went to every single door on every single street in the ward for years. Her favorite of Councilor LaBarge’s achievements was getting the full blown light at Westhampton Road and Ryan Road. She has the energy of an Olympian. She is the boldest woman she knows. City councilors will come and go but there will never be another Marianne LaBarge. “From my heart I love you and thank you for your service.”

Nina Shields, Ward 3, thanked Councilor Rothenberg for her service to the city. Whenever anyone has asked her, she has told them she is the only city councilor who has tried to help them, and it’s true. Councilor LaBarge’s legacy is significant, but for her and her neighbors, that kind of interest, integrity and speaking truth to power is embodied in Councilor Rothenberg. She is interested to see the dynamic on the Council and in public dialogue going forward without Councilor Rothenberg as a scapegoat for the city’s problems. She is hopeful several incoming councilors will continue working for people and not for power. “Maybe you’ve also been tallying the number of restaurants and cafes that have announced closure since the Mayoral election,” she suggested. Just this week, she has spoken to several business owners who

have not seen the needed demand this holiday season “and have rarely, if ever, felt interest from City Hall in supporting them now or during the disruption of Picture Main Street.”

She is hopeful the new council will attempt to support their business community so they will have a vibrant downtown Northampton and Florence. She hopes that includes accessibility improvements and sidewalk and road repairs that have been necessary for decades.

She is hopeful that the incoming council will see that there's a wide spectrum between tax money for unfettered luxury development on one hand and working with the community to solve housing needs on the other. She is hopeful that, working with the School Committee, the incoming Council will allocate the money that they absolutely have to supporting all of their children.

She thanked Councilor Rothenberg again and wished everyone a restful and safe holiday season.

Tom Burton, Northampton, Ward 3, said he is here tonight to say thank you to Q., who's done an awesome job for their district. He thanked Councilor LaBarge specifically for what she did when the housing authority took air conditioners away from folks at McDonalds and she gave them hell. To Q, “you did an outstanding job and I always felt well-represented.”

Gwen Nabad, Ward 1, recently elected as the Ward 1 City Councilor but speaking as a private citizen, thanked Councilor Moulton for his dedication to Ward 1 over the past two terms, service to the city and for supporting her throughout her campaign. She thanked Councilor Jarrett for his dedication to climate issues, sustainability and commitment to community, and for staying grounded in truth and facts. She thanked Councilor LaBarge because she did an amazing thing in fighting for 17 years to get sidewalks over near Florence Heights, and she did it. She really appreciated her making her laugh as they have gotten to know each other. She thanked Councilor Elkins for her commitment and dedication to the city, for keeping the city functioning and for supporting her throughout her campaign even in the smallest way. She thanked Councilor Rothenberg for standing up for vulnerable people and tenants in public housing. She also appreciates her commitment to the city.

Barbara Rakaska, Florence, thanked councilors and read a dedication from Susan Roth. Ms. Roth wrote that she lives in Ward 6 and will be sorry to see Councilor LaBarge leave her post. Besides all she has done for the community, she has helped her personally over the last 20 years. She welcomed her and her husband when they moved to Northampton, brought them gifts like a leaf-gathering basket for autumn cleanups, a garden sculpture and variously wrapped Christmas presents. She helped get her mother into low-income housing so she could live nearby. It was great working with her to save the Mineral Hills Conservation Area. During election years, she delivered her campaign flyers door to door. Marianne cares about people. They were lucky to have her as their ward councilor and to continue to have her as their neighbor.

As examples of Councilor LaBarge's work, she cited the C-54 Memorial on Florence Road, Habitat for Humanity affordable housing and helping any resident with any issue, big or small.

Sara Howard, Florence, expressed her utmost appreciation and gratitude for the work of her wonderful city councilor who also happens to be her wonderful spouse, Alex Jarrett. She has had a firsthand view of the incredible amount of dedication and thoughtfulness Alex has brought to this work. Alex is a person of genuine caring for the well-being of the community and has put in uncountable hours of diligent effort: continuous listening, scrupulous research, nights of worrying, moments of humor, tears, celebration, lots and lots of connecting and collaborating, tremendous compassion, limitless patience and the utmost integrity and humility in the past six years. He is one of the kindest humans she has ever known. He also happens to have a brilliant mind. He has made skillful use of zoning and other ordinance changes and understands how planning and design interconnectedly affect social justice, including housing affordability, climate and economic concerns. Alex has worked, proposed or supported such changes as allowing two housing units to be built anywhere in the city, including ADU's, implementing zoning bonuses for the creation of affordable units, removing parking requirements that add barriers to housing development, the rezoning of Bombyx, rezoning so that housing could be built on the site of the former toxic Bi-chem plant and, most recently, co-sponsoring an ordinance to allow historic accessory structures to be converted to living units, to name a few.

He was also one of the main catalysts, along with Rachel Matoire, for freeing up the funds allowing for the creation of the Division of Community Care (DCC).

[She was informed it was time.]

Michael Bardsley, Ward 3, said he has been a resident for 25 years and served on the City Council for over a dozen, eight of them as council president. From that perspective, he wholeheartedly believes Quaverly Rothenberg has been an outstanding city councilor. She has advocated for her constituents with enthusiasm, passion and the courage of her convictions. She has raised difficult questions that needed to be asked and aggressively challenged proposals she believed were not in Northampton's best interests. That is what a city councilor is supposed to do. For her independent thinking, personal integrity and the honorable manner in which she has conducted herself, he thanked Councilor Rothenberg for her outstanding efforts. The debate of this council regarding the censure of Councilor Rothenberg was, in his opinion, personality politics at its worst. It seemed intended to damage the personal reputation of one who dared challenge the political establishment. It was not the council's finest moment. The wisdom of Voltaire rings true. "It is dangerous to be right in matters in which the established authorities are wrong."

He echoed thanks to Councilor LaBarge for her service.

Aline Davis thanked everyone for their service and work ethic; their ideas and leadership have been an inspiration to her as she has attempted to be a leader in the community as well. She appreciates their public service.

Shelley Berkowitz, Ward 1, thanked Councilor Rothenberg for all she has done, not just for Ward 3 but for all of Northampton for bravely speaking truth to power, especially after the attempt to tarnish her reputation by censure on false and trumped up charges, as Mr. Bardsley said, and despite bullying tactics. Despite this treatment, she persisted. She spoke strongly at School Committee on December 11th when the same censure tactic was again attempted against two Northampton residents who gave respectful, articulate public comment at City Council two days earlier in direct violation of their 1st amendment right to free speech. After Quaverly's comments at that meeting, the censure was walked back and an apology publicly issued by Gwen Agna but not by the mayor. She thanked her for her courage, which she said has served as a catalyst for increased transparency and true change in the city.

"We all know that 76 votes is not a mandate," she continued. She thanked councilors who are leaving, especially Councilor LaBarge for her long service. She is excited and hopeful for both newly-elected and returning councilors who she hopes have learned that 'we the people' expect this increase in transparency and public involvement as the new norm from which they will not back down. She thanked Quaverly for her brilliance, her accomplishments and her compassion, which she suggested will continue regardless of the forum she chooses to serve in.

Karen Foster-Cannon, Northampton, said that when she was a brand new councilor in 2020 there was an issue in one of her neighborhoods that was pretty divisive. As she was bringing people together and meeting with the mayor and residents, someone looked at her and said 'why can't you just be like Councilor LaBarge?'

"Councilor, you set a high bar," she observed. "You represented your residents with such compassion and care, and it was really a thing to see." To Councilor Elkins, Jarrett and Moulton, she said what a privilege it was to serve alongside them. Every single issue that came before them, she knew they had done their due diligence and research and come with what they truly believed to be Northampton's best interests at heart. "Northampton is better for all of you."

Andrea Bertini, Ward 5, thanked Councilor Rothenberg for her commitment to the most marginalized people in their community. She is the only city councilor who actually listened to their story and heard them, she asserted. "You acted, advocated and mobilized," she observed. "You are a leader of a movement. You are and will continue to be the voice of the voiceless in this town." She will continue to be the fierce fighter for civil rights for their kids, calling out what is wrong and holding leaders accountable for their lack of action resulting in national news and DESE findings of wrongdoing. She's watched these meetings for months and seen councilors yell at her, curse at her and work hard to dim her light.

Through it all, she has never wavered from her duties to represent those in Ward 3. "You continue to be an absolute unflappable bad ass," she urged. "What has happened has only amplified your voice and connected a community." Lastly, as the most vetted member of the Quav-wave, she thanked her for pulling them all into her massive tent. In addition, she thanked her for hearing them, for being the change candidate the town needs, for her leadership and willingness to fight for transparency and accountability and for bringing the voices of the voiceless to the forefront.

Ruthy Woodring, Florence, said she has taken some amazingly beautiful walks in the snowy woods lately and is astounded by the beauty of Northampton's conservation areas. One of the things you notice when you walk in the woods in winter is the tracks. It helps you to realize all the variety of creatures trying

to co-exist in Northampton. She encouraged people to spend some time in the woods if they can, saying she really appreciates all the accessible conservation areas and rail trails.

[Former Mayor] **Clare Higgins, Northampton**, said she was there primarily to say thank you to Councilor LaBarge for her decades of service. She actually predated her which means she served with her son, who held the seat before Marianne. They were not always on the same side of an issue but always disagreed in ways they were able to work through. One place they definitely agreed was affordable housing. She was at the forefront of saying, 'there's a lot here, let's use it for Habitat for Humanity.' She constantly advocated for the housing needs of people in the community. Even after she left city government and was working for a local social service agency, Councilor LaBarge reached out and asked what the Rotary Club and Elks could do for kids of their community. Service in her runs long and deep, and she thinks that's not going to end anytime soon. When first elected, Councilor LaBarge called her up to yell at her about something the state was doing on Route 66. Councilor LaBarge and she had many, many conversations about Route 66 and ended up at the right place because Councilor LaBarge never walked away from the table and always tried to find a solution. "The city is going to miss your service."

On this last night of the council's term, **Amy Bookbinder** thanked all of them and the Mayor for their hard work and stepping up to serve Northampton. She gave special thanks to her councilor, Rachel Maiore - their Vice President - Councilor Dubs - local rock star and wonderful councilor - and the fabulous Marianne for her good Finance Committee leadership, advocacy for the disabled and great constituent support, respectively. She offered big thanks to Councilor Rothenberg for her "righteous work" on behalf of Ward 3 and the entire city. *She* has served well, but some of them have not served her - their colleague - or others, well, or democracy, transparency, accountability or the importance of separation of powers in their government, not to mention school children, school staff, school families and the needs and rights of their most marginalized people.

Some have said Northampton now has its own scarlet letter, and that letter is Q. "That's why I'm wearing this proudly," she said, referring to a 'Q' on her fleece, which she said stands for 'Quaverly' and 'Questioning.' She stands with all Councilor Rothenberg has and will continue to do on behalf of a better council and a more democratic government.

[She was told that was time.]

Wendy Mazza, Leeds, said she has had the privilege of knowing Marianne for many years. As a member of the Northampton Elks Lodge, Marianne would deliver thanksgiving baskets to people in need and she saw how much her acts of kindness meant to them. She learned a lot by going with her. She worked with Councilor LaBarge on a fashion show with proceeds going to Cooley Dickinson Hospital. She dressed as an elf at the children's Christmas party and danced around. There were so many times Marianne donated her time to causes she believes in. She will be missed but she knows she will always be ready to help the people in Ward 6. She personally thanked her for her years of service.

[Former Mayor] **Mary Ford**, said that, looking around the room, she sees Northampton, a community they all love in all its variety. One of the things she remembers about serving with Marianne is that, even though the city kept changing a lot and often functioned in tribes; she never let on being part of any tribe; she respected the individuals she chose to serve. She noticed she never called them 'constituents;' she doesn't think she thought of it as being an exchange. She would say, "my people." She didn't mean they were a group she was in control of; they were people to her and that's why she brought their issues forward. That's why they were so comfortable sharing their issues, trusting her to take them up. "You've just been a wonderful public servant," she volunteered. She wished them all well.

[She was told it was time.]

Lynn Simmons, Ward 6, added her voice to other voices expressing their appreciation to Councilor LaBarge. She thanked her for being her city councilor for half her life. What sticks out most about her as a city councilor is the relationships she developed with her constituents. She knows everyone personally - what's going on in their homes and where they might be struggling - and she connects them with resources. "Thank you and enjoy what comes next," she enjoined.

Denise Lello, Northampton, publicly thanked outgoing councilors for their service. City councilors devote an enormous amount of time and energy to serving the community. Their job is to make decisions on behalf of their constituents taking into account their concerns as well as the good of the broader community. Always, they must listen carefully and ask questions for clarification. Her primary concern is climate change because it is the problem that impacts and dwarfs every other issue. She recognized three councilors in particular for their efforts to mitigate as well as ameliorate climate change: Councilor Moulton, who has addressed many issues in a caring and supportive manner, Councilor Elkins, who has

always done her homework and asked for additional study when information is unclear and is open to changing her opinion if the facts warrant it, and Councilor Jarrett, who earned admiration and gratitude for his service, first as a councilor and second as president. His patience and openness to citizen comments combined with the fairness and discipline necessary to run effective meetings is a model.

Megan Wolf, Northampton, Ward 4, thanked everyone for their service this term, especially outgoing Councilor Moulton, Councilor Elkins, Councilor Jarrett, Councilor LaBarge and Councilor Rothenberg. She offered sincere gratitude to Councilor LaBarge for her decades of service to the city. 30 years of public service is not just a measure of time, it represents thousands of meetings, votes and conversations with constituents and many difficult decisions made in full view of the public. Whether or not they always agreed, that level of commitment deserves recognition and respect. More broadly, serving in elected office requires judgment and restraint and a willingness to engage in disagreement without personalizing it. Their local democracy depends on the ability to debate strongly, hold one another accountable and still respect the processes that govern them. Disagreement is not misconduct, accountability is not persecution, she stressed. Feeling aggrieved does not make one a victim, especially when established processes are followed and colleagues are acting in good faith. When conflicts move from policy disagreement into personal grievance, it undermines trust not only among elected officials but between the public and the institutions meant to serve them. As they mark this transition, 30 years of service reflects a deep investment in this community and the often unseen work of local governance. She hopes they can honor that legacy by strengthening, not weakening, the norms that make public bodies function.

Nathan Chung, Northampton, offered general thanks to everyone in the western Mass region for making it through this year. It's been a rough year, so he thanked councilors, other elected officials, appointed officials and those who work in government and those who don't, just for making it through. He personally found it very helpful to read children's books from the Forbes library, he shared. He held up the book "Hoptoad" by Jane Yolen. They live in a society with too much information so people have to 'upcycle' and 'downcycle,' he suggested. He thinks this is a really nice way to relax. With the holiday's coming up, he recommended taking some time to relax and read some children's books.

Laurie Loisel, Northampton, sincerely thanked departing councilors who worked hard for the good of their city. Councilor Jarrett has shown stellar leadership at a time when it was badly needed, and his knowledge of parliamentary procedure helped meetings run smoothly. She always counted on Councilor Moulton to bring the conversation back to salient facts, and he is a model for coming to a meeting prepared. She admired Councilor Elkin's breadth of knowledge about legislative matters, intelligence, and important work that led to the creation of the reparations committee. Finally, she thanked Councilor LaBarge for her unparalleled devotion to not only her ward but all of Northampton. She also thanked those staying on: Councilors Perry, Klemmer, Maiore and Dubs. It's a difficult time to be engaged in public office when elected officials get blamed for things not under their control. They often don't hear appreciation when they get things right, so she just wants to thank them for all their work.

Melissa Maciborski, thanked all of the councilors who kept people at the center of their work. Quaverly Rothenberg, "you know this means you," she confided. "We'll see you in the next cycle."

Scott Jackson, Northampton, completed Amy Bookbinder's unfinished statement at her request. At the last School Committee meeting of the term last week, a request for censure was put forth by two School Committee members and approved by the Mayor for two members returning next term. After public outcry, the censure was withdrawn with an apology for a mistake and the division it caused in the city. Quaverly apologized for mistaken votes she made on a resolution. On Ms. Bookbinder's behalf, he asked councilors, 'where is your apology for censuring Quaverly?' And where is the Gazette's apology for mentioning the censure every time her name was mentioned in articles throughout the campaign? Their censure on dubious grounds was shameful if not ableist and conspiratorial and, in the opinion of many, led to her losing her seat on the council. Those who continue to treat her with the worst contempt, rudeness, disrespect and attempted silencing will not be returning to this council either, for which she is thankful. She hopes the new council will not repeat their misguided, uncivil behavior toward their colleagues, the people of Northampton, or democracy itself. "Good night and good luck, signed Amy Bookbinder," he concluded.

Virginia Ahearn, Ward 1, thanked Councilor Jarrett and everyone else.

George Kohout, State Street, facetiously asked Marianne if she could take any more accolades. It's been a great treat to work with her the past 28 years. Many citizens don't understand how many hours councilors put in. He thanked her for all her hard work. He had a chance to work with Councilor Elkins on the Planning Board, which was just wonderful, and he thought she brought a lot of those skills and perspectives to the City Council debates. He thanked Councilor Moulton, his neighbor and Ward 1 councilor, for his greatly informative newsletter and for being very responsive to everyone in Ward 1.

“Alex, your partner said it all,” he volunteered. “You’re a bit of a wonky guy; you wear that with pride.” He and Councilor Elkins did some great jobs on revising some of their city ordinances, whether on lighting or around housing and zoning. He also thanked him for “waving the progressive banner,” which always needs to be held high. For all the councilors coming on again, “good luck and God bless.”

Jen Nery, Ward 3, noted that times are very difficult across the country and cities this size are particularly pinched. She knows many of them have worked very hard to make things here as good as they can be. She knows many of them have paid a toll in terms of their well-being and in terms of their family. She really hopes that the next steps are focused on getting some peace.

There being no further comments, Councilor Jarrett brought public comment to a close.

<u>Recess</u>	<u>Recess</u> The City Council recessed briefly at 7:49 p.m. The council reconvened at 7:58 p.m.
----------------------	--

<u>Announcements</u>	<p><u>Announcements</u></p> <p>Saying it was an honor to serve as council president, Councilor Jarrett addressed each councilor in turn to share his appreciation for his/her unique contributions. To Councilor Elkins, it’s been wonderful to work with her on ordinances and resolutions, he shared. “We did some things,” he allowed. He appreciates her eloquent discourse on the challenges facing the city and its difficult financial situation. To Councilor Perry, he appreciated his tireless work on recognition that the success of their city is linked to the success of their downtown, as well as his candor and willingness to slow things down to gather all information and viewpoints. Councilor Moulton’s researched and thoughtful opinions, newsletters and analysis of council decisions helped him to consider many angles on every issue, he noted. “It was fabulous to cosponsor and work together,” he added. He loved working with Councilor Klemer on the Transportation and Parking Commission (TPC), her newsletters and her work seeking input from constituents and getting the facts out there. To Councilor Rothenberg, he said he appreciated her passion and tenacity and her desire for a better Northampton. He commended Councilor Dubs for his commitment to moving accessibility for all forward with the recognition that it <i>is</i> for everyone and his considered and value-centered decision-making. He is very excited he is going to carry the work on sidewalk snow-clearing forward and hopes to see significant progress there.</p> <p>He commended Councilor LaBarge for her nonstop constituent work and communication and recalled walking Florence Road with her years ago as one of their common ward boundaries. “It’s great to see those improvements finally coming,” he related. She let him and city staff know exactly what concerned her residents and never stopped advocating.</p> <p>He said it has been an honor to share leadership with Councilor Maiore. He has sought her counsel with almost every leadership decision, and it was helpful to talk through many difficult decisions. Referring to their work together on climate, public safety and other issues, she has been a steady collaborator for six years, he observed.</p> <p>He thanked Mayor Sciarra for her former work as a councilor, saying he has appreciated the tough decisions she’s had to make and knows how hard the past two years have been. “You’ve moved so many amazing projects forward,” he acknowledged.</p> <p>He also thanked the administrative assistant.</p> <p>Councilor Jarrett said he is excited moving forward to work on depolarization, trying to look at the divisions both locally and nationally. He wants to work to heal divisions. Their local chapter of ‘Braver Angels’ is a great place to start.</p> <p>In what became his time-honored tradition, he concluded by singing an adapted version of “You Can Get it if You Really Want,” by Jimmy Cliff.</p> <p>Councilor Rothenberg began by acknowledging and holding space for the family members and friends of the woman who died in the fire, Local 108 and their mutual aid partners. The last two years have been eye-opening, often troubling but very worthwhile, she shared. As an openly autistic councilor, she has been met with scorn for seeing things differently and expressing herself in ways that don’t conform to the</p>
-----------------------------	---

social expectations of Northampton's political establishment. Unfortunately, some people in that establishment went beyond just expressing ordinary disdain and took extraordinary measures to attack her character and reputation during an election year. Tonight, she wanted to let the people of Northampton know she is suing Councilor Jarrett, Councilor Moulton, Councilor Elkins and Northampton city government. The lawsuit arose from the censure, an unprecedented occurrence in their city. The same fate nearly befell two of her colleagues on School Committee last week. The City Council's baseless but very specific allegations included the crime of public corruption arising from her call to dispatch to report a dangerous icy road which ultimately was closed after the responding officer slipped and fell. She initially sent a cease and desist order demanding a retraction, but the city attorney responded incorrectly that city councilors are free to accuse her of committing crimes since such allegations are merely opinions the truth and falsity of which is irrelevant. The city and three councilors who authored the resolution have been served and she looks forward to a fair trial in a court of law to show that she has done nothing wrong and that, in fact, they have. Her hope is that, going forward, they can all remember that disagreeing is part of their jobs and not a crime. She is heartened and encouraged by the changes in political culture she has witnessed and is proud to be a part of in their community. She is heartened by all of them. It has been an honor to serve Ward 3. She hopes her legacy as a councilor will be that of someone who pushed for accountability and transparency and for the council to assert itself as a co-equal branch of government and for emphasizing the value of centering the voice of the public and the needs of their most vulnerable neighbors in every decision the council makes.

Councilor Perry reminded folks that it is a great time to enjoy their community with First Night celebrations happening Wednesday, December 31st, including fireworks at 6:15 p.m. and the traditional ball-raising at the Hotel Northampton. More information can be found at firsnightnorthampton.org. He thanked departing colleagues as they transition to the 'Valhalla of councilors.' They may return, but know "you will always be here in my heart."

Councilor Elkins said it has been a tremendous honor and her privilege to serve the city of Northampton; not many things she does in life will be as consequential. She has learned a tremendous amount and worked hard to come always prepared, to know her own mind and to change her opinion when necessary and hold firm when appropriate. She thanked city staff and department heads. She could not be more in awe of their work and commitment to this city. She feels like she has gotten a mini degree in city planning by working with Carolyn Misch and has seen pictures of the most disgusting things in the city's sewer system courtesy of Director LaScaleia. It has been an honor and a privilege to work with all the councilors she's served with. She is so happy Mayor Sciarra will be with them for the next four years. She is confident she is the leadership they need and has been proud to work alongside her.

Finally, she thanked her family. In four years, her wife has not come to a single meeting, but Tara and Bess are watching tonight on YouTube. Their families really do give up a lot of time with them. She is looking forward to having some weeknights back with them.

Councilor LaBarge thanked Councilor Jarrett for being who he is. He has worked tirelessly as their council president. She finds that his voice has become stronger and she thinks having a little stronger voice makes it easier for a Council President. She doesn't know what they will do without the knowledge of Councilor Elkins. She thanked Councilor Perry, saying she hopes he continues on and eventually becomes council president or vice president because that's where he belongs. She thanked Councilor Moulton, calling him a 'great asset,' and told Councilor Klemer she would miss her dearly, adding she would love to see her as council president. She rounded out her remarks by thanking Councilor Dubs, Councilor Rothenberg, Councilor Maiore, the Mayor, the Finance Director, Chief of Staff Alan Wolf and the administrative assistant.

Councilor Moulton confined his remarks to giving thanks, first thanking constituents who put their faith in him and others in the city who reached out to engage him, the vast majority in a very civil way. Trying to listen to different points of view in a respectful manner does not mean they are trying to silence critics, he stressed. He also thanked the hundreds of people who volunteer to serve on the city's multi-member boards and committees. As chair of City Services, he has had the opportunity to get to know them and to appreciate the diversity they bring to their city.

All the department heads he has worked with are consummate professionals and the city is very fortunate to have them, he continued. He is happy to see [former council president and vice president] Jim Nash and Karen Foster Cannon here tonight, having appreciated their distinctive leadership in his first term. To

his colleagues who worked diligently to problem solve and address their many challenges, he thanked them for working respectfully together. Though they didn't agree on all the issues they treated each other in a respectful manner. He thanked Councilor Jarrett and Councilor Maire for their inclusive leadership. He did not write a poem or bring a color guard but said Councilor LaBarge was 'one of a kind' and 'a woman with a big heart.' Similarly, he told the administrative assistant she was 'the glue that held the council together.'

"Mayor Sciarra, your leadership has been inspirational," he avowed. With the federal government not only dismantling the constitution but dismantling many social safety nets so many people depend on, her progressive, visionary leadership has resulted in a long list of accomplishments: creation of the Division of Community Care (DCC), the Climate Action and Project Administration (CAPA), preparation for Picture Main Street to revitalize downtown and make it safer and more inviting, support for more than 280 affordable housing units and a \$10.7 million investment in Northampton Public Schools (NPS) over four years.

Councilor Klemer also paid tribute to fellow councilors, saying she enjoyed working with all of them, while Councilor Dubs said he learned a lot from each and every one. To newly-elected councilors, he is looking forward to working with them and finding out what they can accomplish together.

Councilor Maire announced a tractor parade December 27th. She'll be a judge. The parade will be going through Florence Center and Look Park.

Reflecting on this term, what she's left with is those moments in between, Councilor Maire shared. To outgoing councilors, "it has been an honor." She complimented Councilor Jarrett as a stellar leader 'noticeably lacking in ego' and amazing friend.

Mayor Sciarra thanked all of the councilors for their work this term, offering thanks to departing councilors for their work and dedication. She thanked Councilor Rothenberg for her two years of service and her passion. She has had the privilege of serving with Councilor Elkins and Councilor Moulton for the entirety of her first term as mayor. "It is truly a tremendous body of work that you have accomplished," she said. She had the honor of serving as a councilor with Councilor Jarrett and Councilor LaBarge. She thanked Councilor Jarrett for his leadership, equanimity and the remarkable time and care he has dedicated to this work. She will miss their twice monthly meetings for not just the good work and great conversation but also the joy of spending time with him.

Mayor Sciarra invoked Shirley Chisholm's famous quote: "If they don't give you a seat at the table, bring a folding chair." With respect to Councilor LaBarge, another quote attributed to Chisholm exemplifies her: "Service is the rent that you pay for room on this earth."

"Councilor LaBarge, you live that ethos," she intoned. Northampton was incorporated in 1884 but its City Council began in 1958; before then there were aldermen and common council systems. Since there has been a city council, Councilor LaBarge is the longest serving councilor in Northampton history, first taking office in 1998. She presented her with a plaque to recognize her exceptional service.

Presentations

Presentations

Northampton High School (NHS) Road Safety Project Update

Following an introduction by Mayor Sciarra, DPW Director Donna LaScaleia updated councilors on the NHS Road Safety Project.

The project addresses safety issues around Northampton High School (NHS) on Elm Street, North Elm Street and Woodlawn Avenue, Mayor Sciarra presented. A crash analysis by Fuss & O'Neill showed each intersection experienced one to two crash each year over the past five and a half years, one of which resulted in a bicyclist's death. Two others involved pedestrians on North Elm and Elm. "These instances created a clear and urgent mandate for safety improvements," she confirmed.

Public meetings to solicit community input revealed a wide spectrum of perspectives. Over the course of conversations, participants naturally coalesced into groups with different priorities, notably bicyclists and high school parents, whose strongly held and often competing views shaped the discussion. After listening closely, city officials have refocused the project on the essential safety improvements originally envisioned and developed a balanced plan reflecting the concerns and priorities heard.

The design for upgrades to the corridor in front of the high school have been in progress for about 15 months, Director LaScaleia continued. Design engineer Fuss & O'Neill recommended a wide range of improvements to enhance safety in a radius around the high school, including signalized intersections on Route 9 and restoration of the old bus loop directly in front of the high school. The available funding is \$1.5 million in ARPA funds which must be fully expended by September 30, 2026 and an additional \$1.5 million from the capital plan. Ultimately, their greatest concern was for students crossing Route 9 at pickup and dismissal and for bicyclists.

Director LaScaleia screen-shared a rendering of what she said is close to the final design. She highlighted important safety improvements to be implemented as shown on the plan. The primary safety improvement is the installation of two signalized intersections at Woodlawn Avenue and Route 9 and Elm Street and Route 9, she noted. The signals will have 'exclusive pedestrian phasing,' meaning cars in all directions will stop when the pedestrian push button is activated.

For this project, she is often asked why they didn't do a rotary. A roundabout will not geometrically fit due to the proximity of Childs Park and other private properties and would be subject to domain takings, she explained. They ultimately decided signalized traffic signals will provide the safest scenario for students to cross the street. They have implemented a school speed zone of 20 mph with flashing beacons. Because there is free-flowing traffic on Route 9, even with a school zone limit of 20 mph; left and right turn movements onto Route 9 from the minor approaches of Woodlawn Avenue and Elm Street are risky and difficult during high traffic times. So, signalization of these intersections is going to greatly improve the safety of all cross movements for school buses, cars, pedestrians and bicyclists.

Additionally, they have narrowed travel lanes to reduce traffic speeds, she continued. The existing travel lane width on Route 9 is between 12 and 14 feet and it is going to be decreased to 11 feet, while the turn lanes on Woodlawn and Elm Street will be 10 feet.

Plans also call for reconstructing existing medians, new ADA compliant curb ramps, shifting of the existing inbound bus stop slightly towards downtown and the intentional shrinking of crossing distances in the crosswalks as well as the installation of continuous protected bike lanes on Route 9. Five-foot bike lanes separated from travel lanes by a four-foot concrete buffer with rumble strips will extend through the project area. Pavement will be milled and overlaid to allow for high-visibility striping and new signage is proposed. She will be coming to City Council for an ordinance implementing parking restrictions along Route 9 and the left-turn movement from Woodlawn Avenue onto Route 9 will be restored.

With a project like this, they need to be careful of scope creep. If they try to engage in major geometrical reconstruction, the project becomes unaffordable because they would need to address utilities. Given the budget and their schedule, city officials are confident the design of this project will improve core safety. The traffic movements and volume of people moving through this corridor is significant. They are confident this project accomplishes the core needs of protecting the most vulnerable users. ARPA funding must be fully expended by September 30, 2026, she reiterated. They need to move on this project, and it will be bid in January for as immediate construction as can be arranged.

Councilor Rothenberg asked about public input on this design.

Director LaScaleia said they have had multiple renderings that looked like this but didn't have a separated bike lane.

Rothenberg asked what she would say are lingering concerns of the public with this design?

The separated bike lanes on Route 9 will restrict parking. Some members of the school community like to park on Route 9 for pick-up and drop-off. As part of this public process there were competing priorities, but this is the safest design for bicyclists. In their professional opinion, the loss of these parking spaces is actually going to be a benefit to the school community.

Councilor Jarrett said he and others advocated for alternatives to stop lights, in part because stop lights do not slow the speed of traffic passing through. He does appreciate that narrowing the lanes will slow speed and the commitment to year-round bicycle lanes.

Councilor Rothenberg asked the projected cost differential between protected bike lanes and non-protected bike lanes.

Director LaScaleia said it's more of a maintenance issue. Physical barriers themselves are not particularly expensive; the issue is the operations and maintenance cost of fixing the post when it gets hit. The plan is

to use scored concrete to separate them. This will be absorbed into the DPW's operating budget as compared to being a capital expense to install physical barriers.

Councilor Jarrett thanked Director LaScaleia for the presentation.

Bullet-point Summary of Ordinance Review Committee Recommendations

Councilor Dubs and Councilor Perry described the review process and presented the recommendations of the 2025 Ordinance Review Committee. They thanked committee citizen members, Administrative Assistant Laura Krutzler and Attorney Seewald for their assistance.

Councilor Maiore and Councilor Elkins thanked the committee for its work, with Councilor Elkins referring to it as 'shovel-ready legislation.' She hopes to see councilors take some of these recommendations and run with them.

Consent Agenda

Consent Agenda

Councilor Jarrett reviewed the items on the consent agenda. There being no removals, **Councilor Moulton moved to approve the consent agenda. Councilor LaBarge seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by voice vote.**

The following items were approved as part of the consent agenda:

- A. Minutes of December 4, 2025
- B. 25.342 Appointments to Arts Council and Trust Fund Committee, all positive recommendations, City Services - 12/15/2025

Arts Council

Clara Barnhart, 17 Madison Ave

Term: November 2025 - June 2028

To fill a vacancy

Trust Fund Committee

Casey Quinn, 20 Harrison Ave

Term: November 2025 - June 2027

To fill a vacancy

- C. 25.352 Appointment to Northampton Housing Authority, positive recommendation, City Services – 12/15/2025

Northampton Housing Authority

William Abrashkin, 26 Adare Place

Term: December 2025 - June 2026

Filling the term of Maureen Carney

- D. 25.356 Application for Supervised Display of Fireworks - First Night

Financial Orders (on 1st reading)
25.359 An Order to Authorize Payment of Prior Year Invoices - 1st reading

Financial Orders (on 1st reading)

25.359 An Order to Authorize Payment of Prior Year Invoices - 1st reading

Councilor LaBarge moved to suspend the rules to waive two readings. Councilor Dubs seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by voice vote.

Councilor Elkins moved to approve the order. Councilor Perry seconded. The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.

The following order passed final reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council

December 18, 2025

Upon recommendation of Mayor Sciarra

25.359 An Order to Authorize Payment of Prior Year Invoices

Ordered, that

The City Council authorize payment of two prior fiscal year invoices (FY2025) for the Department of Health and Human Services:

Big Y Foods, Inc. – \$34.74

Ernie’s Garage, Inc. –\$35.00

Passed final reading and enrolled.

Financial Orders (on 2nd reading)
25.353 An Order to Reprogram Memorial Hall Funds for City-Wide Building Portfolio Upgrades – 2nd reading

Financial Orders (on 2nd reading)
25.353 An Order to Reprogram Memorial Hall Funds for City-Wide Building Portfolio Upgrades – 2nd reading
Councilor Elkins moved to approve. Councilor Moulton seconded.

Councilor Rothenberg said she asked Chief of Staff Alan Wolf to send her a breakdown of expenditures for the most recent work. She asked if anyone could explain why the two most recent payments to Keiter were not in Open Checkbook.

Mayor Sciarra pointed out that the invoices referenced are not associated with this agenda item. Director Nardi said she believes the payments Councilor Rothenberg is talking about are for emergency repairs to Memorial Hall and not this project.

Councilor Rothenberg wondered if they would still like to answer the question of why the invoices do not yet appear on Open Checkbook. It may simply be a question of how the accounting system works.

Councilor Jarrett said he did not think it was relevant to the project at hand.

“But, is it more important to bury your sword on the relevance than to not answer a question that would seem like it's avoiding just basic transparency?” Councilor Rothenberg persisted. “It's probably an easily answerable question,” she suggested.

Councilor Moulton said he believed it is out of order. “We’re discussing a different project; we’re discussing different money,” he pointed out.

Councilor Jarrett agreed.

Councilor Elkins raised the point of order that it is a violation of Open Meeting Laws (OML) to discuss items not on the agenda.

Councilor Rothenberg asked how the bidding for the new study project will take place.

An RFP will be created, and it will be put out to bid, Director Nardi said.

Councilor Rothenberg asked why councilors feel this should not be part of the CIP?

Councilor Perry reiterated that he would love to get a sense of how many buildings are included in the city-wide building portfolio.

Mayor Sciarra said they are planning a tour with Central Services.

Councilor Rothenberg said it is great that the immediate needs came in under budget. However, there is no reason these funds should not be returned to the Undesignated Fund (Free Cash), no reason this should not be on the CIP and no reason the new council should not be considering it. This will be a 'no' vote for her.

Director Nardi clarified that this is not money left over. The City Council appropriated \$400,000 for looking at efficiency reconfiguration of Memorial Hall as part of the CIP. They are asking the council to reprogram the funding for a larger look including additional buildings.

Councilor Maiore reminded that, at the time, the feedback from residents was that they wanted them to look at a broader scope.

Councilor Jarrett said he sees this as a way to audit internally and gain expertise externally for their buildings and their usage, and he hopes it will generate savings.

Councilor Elkins said she generally thinks where ever there are opportunities to look at things holistically they should do so since it leads to greater efficiencies.

Councilor Rothenberg expressed her understanding that it is \$400,000 to pay consultants to look at their buildings. Director Nardi confirmed that is the case.

Councilor Rothenberg started to speak, and Councilor Jarrett asked her to please raise her hand.

Councilor Rothenberg asked him to please make an accommodation.

Councilor Maiore raised the point of order that they are speaking out of turn, and Councilor Jarrett sustained the objection. **Councilor Maiore called the question. Councilor Elkins seconded. The motion carried 8:1 by voice vote with Councilor Rothenberg opposed.**

The motion to approve carried 8:1 by roll call vote with Councilor Rothenberg opposed.

The following order passed final reading:

APPROVED - 25.353
An Order to
Reprogram
Memorial Hall Funds
for City-Wide
Building Portfolio
Upgrades – 2nd
reading

City of Northampton

MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council

December 4, 2025

Upon recommendation of Mayor Sciarra

25.353 An Order to Reprogram Memorial Hall Funds for City-Wide Building Portfolio Upgrades

WHEREAS, on January 22, 2025 as part of the FY2026 CIP, the City Council appropriated \$400,000 for *Memorial Hall Structural Remediation & Efficiency Reconfiguration* to address building needs at Memorial Hall; and

WHEREAS, subsequent capital planning discussions identified the need for a comprehensive, citywide facilities assessment to evaluate conditions, space needs, and options for renovation, demolition/reconstruction, or relocation across multiple municipal buildings; and

WHEREAS, the City will draft an RFP for a Citywide Municipal Facilities Analysis to guide this work, including facility condition assessments, space utilization studies, scenario development (renovation, rebuild on existing sites subject to historic restrictions, and relocation to City- or privately-owned properties), conceptual layouts, and order-of-magnitude cost estimates; and

WHEREAS, consolidating this work under a single program—*Building Portfolio Upgrades*—will enable a holistic approach to planning, yield greater efficiency in the use of public funds, and position the City for informed, phased investments; and

WHEREAS, completion of the RFP scope may identify near-term critical repairs and require subsequent design services to advance priority projects emerging from the analysis;

NOW, THEREFORE, BE IT ORDERED,

that the City Council reprogram the Four Hundred Thousand Dollars (\$400,000) from Memorial Hall Structural Remediation & Efficiency Reconfiguration to Building Portfolio Upgrades for the purposes of a Citywide Municipal Facilities Analysis and to fund subsequent design necessary to implement priority recommendations resulting from the study.

Rules suspended, passed final reading and enrolled.

25.354 An Order to
Appropriate
\$112,500 from
Capital Stabilization
for Expanded
Vehicle Leasing –
2nd reading

25.354 An Order to Appropriate \$112,500 from Capital Stabilization for Expanded Vehicle Leasing – 2nd reading

Councilor Rothenberg asked who uses this vehicle.

Finance Director Nardi clarified that it is for 10 vehicles which are part of a pool serving used by multiple employees. CAPA Director Benjamin Weil said the pool serves the Building Department, Central Services and the School maintenance department. The DCC has one vehicle being rotated out.

The DPW is not participating in the leasing program in this phase.

Councilor Perry moved to approve the order. Councilor Moulton seconded.

Councilor Rothenberg asked why Ford cancelled the F-150. Ford determined that the F-150 was not profitable for them, Director Weil said.

The motion passed unanimously 9:0 by roll call vote.

The following order passed final reading:

APPROVED - 25.354
An Order to
Appropriate
\$112,500 from
Capital Stabilization
for Expanded
Vehicle Leasing –
2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council

December 4, 2025

Upon recommendation of Mayor Sciarra

25.354 An Order to Appropriate \$112,500 from Capital Stabilization for Expanded Vehicle Leasing

WHEREAS, excluding the Police and Fire Departments and the Department of Public Works, the City of Northampton maintains a fleet of approximately forty-two vehicles that fall within categories subject to the EV-first vehicle procurement policy; and

WHEREAS, of those, one third are more than a decade old; and

WHEREAS, most of the current fleet consists of internal combustion vehicles that could be replaced with battery electric vehicles, which have significantly lower emissions and operating and maintenance costs; and

WHEREAS, those vehicles for which electric vehicle options are either unavailable or not cost-effective can be replaced with newer, more efficient functionally-equivalent vehicles, which also result in lower emissions; and

WHEREAS, older vehicles lack safety features that are standard on new vehicles that would reduce the likelihood of insurance claims and costs associated with crashes; and

WHEREAS, many departments have requested new vehicles on the capital improvement plan, but repeatedly postponed acquisition to later years; and

WHEREAS, for the above reasons, more rapid updating of the municipal fleet would help the city pursue its goals of reduced maintenance and operations costs, reduced fossil fuel consumption, and a transition toward decarbonization of municipal operations; and

WHEREAS, on average the city acquires 3.1 new vehicles per year at an average annual cost of \$200,000; and

WHEREAS, using an open-ended leasing program, the city can triple the rate of vehicle replacement in one year, with an initial appropriation equivalent to or less than the typical annual appropriation for vehicle purchases; and

WHEREAS, using an open-ended leasing program, the city benefits from the purchasing power and expertise as well as the national sales network of the lease provider; and

WHEREAS, Northampton’s motor pool has piloted vehicle acquisition through an open-ended leasing program and has demonstrated an ability to cut costs in half while achieving

a ten-fold increase in value returned from sales of old vehicles compared to the prior sales approach.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

The City Council appropriate \$112,500 from the Capital Stabilization Fund for the city’s leasing program.

Rules suspended, passed final reading and enrolled.

Financial Orders (on
2nd reading, cont.)

Financial Orders (on 2nd reading, cont.)

25.343 An Order to Authorize Borrowing and Appropriate \$561,000 in CPA Funds for Veterans Field Pump Track Project - 2nd reading

25.344 An Order to Appropriate \$1,965 to Meadow City Conservation Coalition for Trail Improvement Project - 2nd reading

25.345 An Order to Appropriate \$3,000 in CPA Funds for Mill River Greenway Tree Planting - 2nd reading

25.346 An Order to Appropriate \$320,300 in CPA Funds for Mineral Hills Open Space Acquisition - 2nd reading

25.347 An Order to Appropriate \$75,000 in CPA Funds To PVH4H for Westhampton Road Affordable Home - 2nd reading

25.348 An Order to Appropriate \$600,000 in CPA Funds for 27 Crafts Avenue Affordable Housing Project - 2nd reading

25.349 An Order to Appropriate \$25,000 in CPA Funds to Install Electronic Scoreboards at Florence Fields - 2nd reading

25.350 An Order to Appropriate \$3,000 in CPA Funds to Forbes Library for Coolidge Desk Project - 2nd reading

Councilor Dubs moved to approve all eight (8) CPA orders as a group. Councilor LaBarge seconded.

Councilor Jarrett said he appreciated the email received from Assistant Director Sarah LaValley with answers to pump track questions.

Councilor Rothenberg said she would like to remove the pump track to vote on separately; however, there was not unanimous consent to withdraw the motion.

Councilor Rothenberg said that, although she agrees with everything besides the pump track, she will vote 'no.' It has been presented as something beneficial to those in affordable housing because of its proximity but none of her residents have indicated a desire for this; they have other immediate needs. The city has plenty of recreational facilities that are not being maintained. There is no reason to add new things when they are not taking care of what they already have. She will vote 'no' although she does not oppose any other projects.

Councilor Elkins noted that CPA projects are never included on the CIP and the project involved extensive public fundraising.

Councilor Moulton said he was first introduced to the pump track project in 2022 when he served on the ARPA review committee. There was significant public input and support, he attested. In response to the claim that it will not be maintained, the email received from Sarah LaValley today specifically outlines an agreement the Northampton Cycling Club (NCC) has made with the Parks and Rec department about how it will be maintained.

They have many bathrooms at many facilities that don't exist, Councilor Rothenberg said. She acknowledged it was brought through the CPA but contended that the CPA exists to encourage communities to do non-essential things in lean years. It is hard to justify this when they have kids that can't read. . .

Councilor Elkins raised the point of order that it is not pertinent to the agenda item.

The fact that a well-organized, privileged group of residents pushing for their hobby came to the CPA is not a compelling reason, Councilor Rothenberg asserted. They should do more outreach to ensure everyone in their community knows how to bring requests to the CPA.

Councilor Perry said he is very pleased to hear that the bathroom will be maintained as it is a public restroom many people use. He is pleased to see this because it brings much-needed attention to the area.

Councilor Elkins called the question. Councilor LaBarge seconded. The motion carried 8:1 by voice vote with Councilor Rothenberg opposed.

The motion to approve passed 8:1 by roll call vote with Councilor Rothenberg opposed.

The following eight (8) orders passed final reading:

APPROVED - 25.343
An Order to
Authorize Borrowing
and Appropriate
\$561,000 in CPA
Funds for Veterans
Field Pump Track
Project - 2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee

25.343 An Order to Authorize Borrowing and Appropriate \$561,000 in CPA Funds for Veterans Field Pump Track Project

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, the Northampton Cycling Club and Parks and Recreation Department submitted an application for Community Preservation Act funding for creation of a bicycle skills pump track at Veterans Field;

WHEREAS, the project will provide an alternative recreational and sporting opportunity in an existing accessible and dynamic park facility;

WHEREAS, the pump track has widespread support, will contribute to positive health status of residents, enhance and revitalize the existing park, and contribute to quality of life by creating new recreational and social opportunities;

WHEREAS, on November 19, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted to recommend that \$561,000 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$561,000 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funds to pay costs of the Veterans Field Pump Track Project, and, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically: That, pursuant to the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee, and in addition to other amounts appropriated therefor, the sum of \$561,000 is hereby appropriated from the Community Preservation Fund to pay costs of design and construction of a pump track located at Veterans Field in order to make it more functional for its intended use and any costs incidental and related thereto (the "Veterans Field Pump Track Project").

To meet this appropriation, the Treasurer, with the approval of the Mayor, is authorized to borrow \$561,000 under and pursuant to Chapter 44B, Section 11 of the General Laws, or pursuant to any other enabling authority, and to issue bonds or notes of the City therefor; that the Mayor is authorized to take any action necessary or convenient to carry out the Veterans Field Pump Track project.

APPROVED - 25.344
An Order to
Appropriate \$1,965
to Meadow City
Conservation
Coalition for Trail
Improvement Project
- 2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee

25.344 An Order to Appropriate \$1,965 to Meadow City Conservation Coalition for Trail Improvement Project

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, the Meadow City Conservation Coalition submitted a CPA small grant application for creation of native pollinator garden and installation of interpretive signage along forested trails;

WHEREAS, the project will expand the recreational and educational values of existing protected open spaces, and will foster deeper community engagement with conservation areas;

WHEREAS, on October 8, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend that \$1,965 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$1,965 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to the Meadow City Conservation Coalition for the Montview and Terrace Trails improvement project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$1,965 is appropriated from the CPA Open Space Reserve (account #2344930-359931).

APPROVED - 25.345
An Order to
Appropriate \$3,000
in CPA Funds for
Mill River Greenway
Tree Planting - 2nd
reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee
25.345 An Order to Appropriate \$3,000 in CPA Funds for Mill River Greenway Tree Planting

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, the Mill River Greenway Initiative submitted a CPA small grant application for planting of 20 trees on permanently protected open spaces within the Mill River Greenway;

WHEREAS, the trees are part of a larger project to commemorate the Mill River Flood of 1874 and its victims, and will serve multiple ecological and social functions;

WHEREAS, on October 8, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend that \$3,000 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$3,000 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to the Mill River Greenway Initiative for the Mill River Greenway Tree Planting project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$3,000 is appropriated from the CPA Open Space Reserve (account #2344930-359931).

APPROVED - 25.346
An Order to
Appropriate
\$320,300 in CPA
Funds for Mineral
Hills Open Space
Acquisition - 2nd
reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee

25.346 An Order to Appropriate \$320,300 in CPA Funds for Mineral Hills Open Space Acquisition

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, the Northampton Conservation Commission and Office of Planning & Sustainability submitted a CPA application for purchase of 72 acres in the Mineral Hills;

WHEREAS, the parcel includes existing trails and viewsheds, vernal pools and headwater streams, and a diversity of landforms, surficial geology and hydrology that create important wildlife habitat and climate change resiliency, and will connect to other protected open spaces;

WHEREAS, CPA funds will be used as a match for an already received \$297,330 state Local Acquisitions for Natural Diversity Grant;

WHEREAS, on November 19, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend that \$320,300 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$320,300 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to the Northampton Conservation Commission and Office of Planning and Sustainability for the Mineral Hills South open space acquisition Project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$249,710 is appropriated from the CPA Open Space Reserve (account #2344930-359931), and \$70,590 is appropriated from the CPA Budgeted Reserve (account #2344930-359930).

APPROVED - 25.347
An Order to
Appropriate \$75,000
in CPA Funds To
PVH4H for
Westhampton Road
Affordable Home -
2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee

25.347 An Order to Appropriate \$75,000 in CPA Funds to PVH4H for Westhampton Road Affordable Home

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, Pioneer Valley Habitat for Humanity submitted an application for Community Preservation Act funding for creation of a carbon-neutral affordable homeownership unit on Westhampton Road;

WHEREAS, Habitat for Humanity has an excellent record of creating housing throughout the City and the Pioneer Valley, and the project has wide community support, leverages funding from many other sources, and utilizes volunteer labor;

WHEREAS, the house will be permanently restricted to individuals and families earning 80% of area median income or below;

WHEREAS, on November 19, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend that \$75,000 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$75,000 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to Pioneer Valley Habitat for Humanity for the Westhampton Road Cottage project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$75,000 is appropriated from the CPA Budgeted Reserve (account #2344930-359930).

Financial Orders (on
2nd reading, cont.)

Financial Orders (on 2nd reading, cont.)
The following orders passed final reading:

25.348 An Order to Appropriate \$600,000 in CPA Funds for 27 Crafts Avenue Affordable Housing Project - 2nd reading

APPROVED - 25.348
An Order to
Appropriate
\$600,000 in CPA
Funds for 27 Crafts
Avenue Affordable
Housing Project -
2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee
25.348 An Order to Appropriate \$600,000 in CPA Funds for 27 Crafts Avenue Affordable Housing Project

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, Valley Community Development Corporation submitted an application for Community Preservation Act funding for creation of an affordable housing project at 27 Crafts Avenue;

WHEREAS, CPA funds will be used to create 30 fossil-fuel free, permanently affordable units in the heart of downtown, with close access to bus transportation, bike travel or by walking to an abundance of workplace opportunities, services and amenities;

WHEREAS, CPA funds will be used to leverage significant funds from a variety of other sources, including an already-received \$921,300 Municipal Vulnerability Program grant, \$450,000 Department of Energy Resources grant, and anticipated additional state grants and low income and renewable energy tax credits;

WHEREAS, on November 19, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee, voted unanimously to recommend that \$600,000 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$600,000 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to the Downtown Affordable Housing Creation Project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$254,675 is appropriated from the CPA Housing Reserve, (account #2344930-359933), and \$345,325 is appropriated from the CPA Budgeted Reserve (account #2344930-359930).

Rules suspended, passed final reading and enrolled.

25.349 An Order to Appropriate \$25,000 in CPA Funds to Install Electronic Scoreboards at Florence Fields - 2nd reading

APPROVED - 25.349
An Order to
Appropriate \$25,000
in CPA Funds to
Install Electronic
Scoreboards at
Florence Fields -
2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee
25.349 An Order to Appropriate \$25,000 in CPA Funds to Install Electronic Scoreboards at
Florence Fields

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, Northampton Parks and Recreation Department submitted a CPA application for installation of two electronic scoreboards at Florence Recreation Fields;

WHEREAS, the project has wide community support, will enhance Florence Fields, an extremely popular recreational resource through addition of a positive feature to benefit players, coaches;

WHEREAS, the scoreboards have already been donated by the Ray Ellerbrook Fund, and the CPA match is necessary only for installation costs.

WHEREAS, on November 19, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend that \$25,000 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support the project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$25,000 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to the Northampton Parks and Recreation for the Florence Fields Scoreboard project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$25,000 is appropriated from the CPA Budgeted Reserve (account #2344930-359930).

Rules suspended, passed final reading and enrolled.

25.350 An Order to Appropriate \$3,000 in CPA Funds to Forbes Library for Coolidge Desk Project -
2nd reading

APPROVED - 25.350
An Order to
Appropriate \$3,000
in CPA Funds to
Forbes Library for
Coolidge Desk
Project - 2nd reading

City of Northampton
MASSACHUSETTS

In City Council, December 4, 2025

Upon the recommendation of the Community Preservation Committee
25.350 An Order to Appropriate \$3,000 in CPA Funds to Forbes Library for Coolidge Desk
Project

Ordered, that

WHEREAS, the Trustees of Forbes Library submitted a CPA small grant application for critical repairs to Calvin Coolidge’s City Council desk;

WHEREAS, restoration of the desk will allow it to be removed from storage and placed on display in an exhibit featuring Coolidge’s service in local and state elected offices prior to becoming president;

WHEREAS, on October 8, 2025, the Northampton Community Preservation Committee voted unanimously to recommend that \$3,000 in Community Preservation Act funds be used to support this project.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT ORDERED,

That \$3,000 be appropriated from Community Preservation Act funding to the Forbes Library for the Coolidge desk project. And, that the grantee meets the conditions approved by the Community Preservation Committee, the Mayor, and City Council.

Specifically, \$3,000 is appropriated from the CPA Historic Preservation Reserve (account #2344930-359932).

Rules suspended, passed final reading and enrolled.

Orders
25.358 An Order to Amend Temporary and Permanent Easements Between the City and Valley CDC to Support Affordable Housing - 1st reading

Orders
25.358 An Order to Amend Temporary and Permanent Easements Between the City and Valley CDC to Support Affordable Housing - 1st reading

Planning Director Carolyn Misch explained that the order is essentially an amendment to an order the City Council adopted in 2021. The original area for temporary and permanent easements has changed since the plan now calls for using the parking area as a geothermal wellfield for 27 Crafts Avenue.

In order for Valley CDC to build the project with geothermal, they need a temporary easement for construction and a permanent easement to access and maintain the wells, Director Misch advised. The expanded area essentially takes in the entire back portion of the city property, including the parking lot and all the way up to the building face.

Councilor Jarrett asked Director Misch to speak to the impacts of drilling on the availability of parking.

During construction, it was always planned for the parking lot to be a staging area for Valley CDC, Director Misch said. Afterwards, they would rebuild the parking lot and vacate it. Putting the bore holes in the parking lot won't prohibit parking in the future. The parking lot will be restored to its slightly altered space reduced by two spaces.

Councilor Maiore asked the timing of the bore hole drilling.

Director Misch said that is a good question. She imagines it would be one of the earlier things to happen.

Councilor Rothenberg said the whole project is really tainted by Wayne Feiden changing the assessment value to avoid triggering a bid. She doesn't want to have anything to do with it. It financially benefited Dorie Brooks. She said she would like to lodge a charter objection.

Councilor Jarrett said she was not able to lodge an objection because it is not on the floor for a vote.

Councilor Klemer moved to suspend the rules. Councilor Elkins seconded. The motion carried 8:1 by voice vote with Councilor Rothenberg opposed.

Councilor Elkins moved to approve the order. Councilor Klemer seconded.

Councilor Rothenberg again attempted to lodge a charter objection.

Councilor Maiore moved to call the question. Councilor Moulton seconded. The motion passed 8:1 by voice vote with Councilor Rothenberg opposed.

Councilor Rothenberg lodged a charter objection.

Councilor Jarrett said they would try to hold special meeting on Tuesday, December 23rd.

See minutes of December 23, 2025 for final reading.

<p><u>Ordinances</u></p>	<p><u>Ordinances</u> None.</p>
<p><u>Zoning Ordinances (Not yet Referred)</u></p>	<p><u>Zoning Ordinances (Not yet Referred)</u> None.</p>
<p><u>Zoning Ordinances</u></p>	<p><u>Zoning Ordinances</u> None.</p>
<p><u>Resolutions</u></p>	<p><u>Resolutions</u> None.</p>
<p><u>Financial Orders (on 2nd reading)</u></p>	<p><u>Financial Orders (on 2nd reading)</u> None.</p>

New Business

New Business

Adjourn

Adjourn

Councilor Perry moved to adjourn. Councilor Moulton seconded. The motion passed unanimously 8:1 by voice vote with Councilor Jarrett opposed. The meeting adjourned at 10:12 p.m.

Attest: _____, Administrative Assistant